



Research Paper

A look at the problems of mental causality from the perspective of transcendental wisdom

Abbas Hakimzadeh^{*1} , Alireza Hasanpour² , Mohammad Mousavi³ 

¹ PhD student, Islamic Philosophy and Theology, Faculty of Theology, Ilam, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Islamic Philosophy and Theology, Faculty of Theology, Ilam, Iran

³ Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy and Islamic Theology, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran

***Corresponding Author:** Abbas Hakimzadeh
Address: Faculty of Theology, Ilam, Iran

Email: s.a.hakim69@gmail.com

[10.22080/JEPR.2025.28218.1236](https://doi.org/10.22080/JEPR.2025.28218.1236)

Received:
December 16, 2024

Accepted:
June 15, 2025

Available online:
June 26, 2025

Keywords:
Mental causality, soul-body
relationship, transcendental
wisdom, dualism, physicalism

Abstract

One of the issues that has long been of interest among philosophers is the recognition of the existential dimensions of man and, as a result, the provision of a comprehensive definition of human identity. This discussion, under the title of the mind-body issue, began in Western philosophy at the time of Descartes, who believed that human identity is composed of two distinct substances: material and abstract. Descartes' inability to dispel doubts such as the relationship between an extended substance and an impermanent substance caused Western analytical philosophers to lean mainly towards physicalism in later periods. However, in Islamic philosophy, the discussion of the relationship between the soul and the body is considered one of the oldest and most interesting topics. In this article, which has been compiled using a descriptive-analytical method, the issue of the relationship between the soul and the body is first examined from the perspective of analytical philosophers, and then, while explaining the course of the issue in Islamic philosophy, Mulla Sadra's opinion on transcendental wisdom is given special attention. The author has finally concluded that based on Mulla Sadra's skeptical monism, the problems with the relationship between soul and body can be answered.



Extended Abstract

1. Introduction

One of the most important problems that has always been considered in philosophy has been the interaction and relationship between the soul and the body. This problem has long been discussed by philosophers in the Islamic philosophy as well as in western philosophy, and perhaps it can be said that no philosopher has been successful in solving all aspects of the problem to this day. The starting point of the the soul-body problem goes back to the fact that we observe two types of human effects: physical effects and mental effects, and these two types of effects indicate two different qualities in the essence of man. Accordingly, in Islamic philosophy and also in west philosophy until the time of Descartes, all philosophers believed in two immaterial and material dimensions in man. The way in which these two dimensions of human existence interact and are affected, and the harmony between them, has raised the debate on mental causality in contemporary analytical philosophy and the relationship between soul and body in Islamic philosophy. In the west, Descartes believed in a substance dualism, that is, there is two essentially distinct substances, namely, the soul and the body; but his inability to provide an accurate account of the interaction of the two and the objections raised against him led a large group of philosophers of the modern era to physicalism. However, in Islamic philosophy, most philosophers to this day maintain that man is a two-dimensional being, that is, composed of an abstract, immaterial substance, lacking extension and nonsensible, called the soul, which governs the material substance called the body. In the history of Islamic philosophy, scholars presented an idea similar to Descartes' idea and believed that man is composed of two distinct substances that interact and influence each other. However, Mulla Sadra, the founder of transcendent wisdom, claims to have depicted the relationship between the soul and the body in such a way that the difficulties of the interaction of the two do not arise.

2. Methodology

This article has been composed by using a descriptive-analytical method, in such a way that first the views of philosophers are quoted from their own works and then a comparison and analysis is made between them.

3. Conclusion

The correct explanation of the relationship between soul and body is one of the most important topics in anthropology. Descartes' inability to explain this relationship and the incomplete and unsuccessful accounts of philosophers after him, such as Malebranche and Leibniz, caused contemporary philosophers to turn away from dualism and turn to physicalism. Physicalism is divided into two branches: reductionist and non-reductionist. The former holds a type of identity and believes that mental events are the same as physical activities of the brain; and the latter maintains that mental events are caused by physical events of the brain, which is referred to as supervenience of mental states on the basis of the physical events. The problem of the soul-body relation and the way in which these two interact has always been raised in Islamic philosophy too. In the history of Islamic philosophy, there are two general approaches to this problem. The approach of Peripatetics such as and Ibn Sina, who holds a view similar to that of Descartes, and he believe that the soul and the body are two separate substances in such a way that the soul has a separable accident called the body, and whenever a moderate temperament is achieved for the body, the soul is impart to the body by an abstract, supernatural intellect. In contrast, Mulla Sadra believes that, according to the principality of existence and its gradation, man is a single identity whose unity is gradational and the highest level of this unity is called the soul while tis lowest level is body. On the other hand, based on the substantial movement, the soul at the beginning of its creation is material; fter going through the stages of perfection and substantial intensity from this body, the incorporeal soul emerges. As a result, the soul and the body are not two separate that would be combined with each other, but they form a single entity so that they are predicated of each other in terms of reality and delicacy, that is, the body is the lowest and most delicate level



of the soul, and the soul is the reality of the body. In other words, the body is the shadow and appearance of inner reality of the soul. According to this account, which is called gradational monism and it is invented by Mulla

Sadr, the delemmas of the causal interaction between the soul and the body, which all resulted from the duality of the two, are resolved.